By centralizing the experiences of seven, urban, self-identified Two-Spirit Indigenous people in Toronto, this paper addresses the settler-colonial complexities that arise within contemporary queer politics: how settler colonialism has seeped into Pride Toronto’s contemporary Queer politics to normalize White queer settler subjectivities and disavow Indigenous Two-Spirit subjectivities. Utilizing Morgensen’s settler homonationalism, the authors underscore that contemporary Queer politics in Canada rely on the eroticization of Two-Spirit subjectivities, Queer settler violence, and the production of (White) Queer narratives of belonging that simultaneously promote the inclusion and erasure of Indigenous presence. Notwithstanding Queer settler-colonial violence, Two-Spirit peoples continue to engage in settler resistance by taking part in Pride Toronto and problematizing contemporary manifestations of settler homonationalism. Findings highlight the importance of challenging the workings of settler colonialism within contemporary Queer politics in Canada, and addressing the tenuous involvements of Indigenous Two-Spirit peoples within Pride festivals. The article challenges non-Indigenous Queers of color, racialized diasporic, and White, to consider the value of a future that takes seriously the conditions of settler colonialism and White supremacy.